

HARALD MOTZKI'S VIEW ON ḤADĪTH AUTHENTICITY
(Analysis Study of Harald Motzki's Method of *Isnād cum Matn* Analysis)



THESIS

Submitted to Ushuluddin Faculty in Partial fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of S-1 of Islamic Theology
on Tafsir and Hadis Department

By:

MUH AMIRUDDIN

Reg. Number: 094211086

USHULUDDIN FACULTY
STATE INSTITUTE FOR ISLAMIC STUDIES (IAIN)
WALISONGO
SEMARANG
2013

THESIS STATEMENT

I certify that this thesis is definitely my own work. I am completely responsible for the content of this thesis. Other writer's opinions or findings included in the thesis are quoted or cited in accordance with ethical standards.

Semarang, November 21st, 2013

The Researcher

Muh Amiruddin
094211086

MOTTO

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

"كل أمر ذي بال لا يبدأ فيه ببسم الله فهو أبت"

(H.R.Abu Hurairah)

DEDICATION

There is no ability and strength except with Allah's willing. I am so conscious that this work would not truly complete without His help.

So I would like to say *Alhamdulillah*, thank you Allah.

- ✍ I dedicated this thesis to my father and my mother (without your prayer, this work will not be completed [may Allah always be with you]), my sisters and brother (may Allah bless you).
- ✍ And especially I dedicate this work for my *kyai*; KH. M. Ma'ruf Irsyad (thanks to always teach and guide me in Allah's way [may Allah be with you forever])
- ✍ I also dedicated this thesis to my beloved friends of FUPK-Depag (may Allah always unite us in one brotherhood) and KKC Indonesia.
- ✍ And I also dedicated this thesis to all of human beings, especially for Muslims in all around the world.
- ✍ Most special dedication for Prof. Harald Motzki (thanks for the support, knowledge, and information)

ABSTRACT

Title : HARALD MOTZKI'S VIEW ON ḤADĪTH AUTHENTICITY
 (Analysis Study of Harald Motzki's Method of *Isnād cum Matn*
 Analysis)
 Researcher : Muh Amiruddin

Keywords : *isnād cum matn* analysis, common link, *al-jarḥ wa al-ta'dīl*, *rijāl*
 books, authentic ḥadīth, matn investigation

This research tries to investigate Harald Motzki's method and his view of authenticity ḥadīth. Motzki conducts the ḥadīth analysis, with the aim of dating ḥadīth, analyzes ḥadīth through the aid of *isnād cum matn* analysis. This method is applied just for complex or interconnected ḥadīth transmissions because this method is focused on the existence of common link and matn investigation. his interpretation of common link phenomenon and dating method show his differences from his predecessors. His dating is not stopped to the common link himself, it will also be possible to be passed on common link's informant if there is a reason for it. Then, his matn investigation, which analyzes the characteristic features by comparing its matns with the aid of common link's existence, tries to open the independency of each matn transmission from the others in all probability of defection. It is because most of ḥadīth transmissions is orally and aurally delivered.

Comparing with Muslim ḥadīth criticism, Muslim ḥadīth scholars base mainly the reliability of transmitters on judgment of critic experts to them (*al-jarḥ wa al-ta'dīl*). While Motzki bases the reliability of transmitters mainly on the text. It is because Western scholarship doesn't fully trust to *rijāl* books, especially its *jarḥ wa ta'dīl*. However, it doesn't mean that he doesn't use *rijāl* books any longer. They use them secondarily in consulting and checking up.

Motzki's result of method application lead to his view of ḥadīth authenticity. He actually still admits the existence of authentic ḥadīth. But the term 'authentic ḥadīth', according to him, is very different from others. Term 'authentic ḥadīth' is not always labeled to the ḥadīth which reaches back to the

Prophet. It is because his research purpose is dating hadith. In the title of his article “*The Muṣannaf of ‘Abd al-Razzāq al-Ṣan’ānī as a Source of Authentic Aḥādīth of the First Islamic Century*”, ‘authentic aḥādīth of the first Islamic century’ doesn’t mean that the ḥadīth really reaches back to the Prophet, but it means that the ḥadīth was really exist in that century, whether it is from the Prophet or not is still uncertainty.

PREFACE

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

All praises due to Allāh, the Creator of universe, the One who has guided me to finish this thesis. Peace and salutation be upon our Prophet Muhammad, the Messenger of Allah.

This thesis entitled; “HARALD MOTZKI’S VIEW ON ḤADĪTH AUTHENTICITY (Analysis Study of Harald Motzki’s Method of *Isnād cum Matn* Analysis)” is submitted to Ushuluddin faculty as a partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of S-1 of Islamic Theology on Tafsir and Hadis Department.

This paper would not finish without the support, help, guidance and advices from numerous people. Therefore, I would like to extend my deep appreciation to all those who have assisted me during my undergraduate study at State Institute for Islamic Studies (IAIN) Walisongo Semarang. Here, I would like to say thanks to:

1. DR. Nashihun Amin, M.Ag, the Dean of Ushuluddin Faculty of State Institute for Islamic Studies (IAIN) Walisongo Semarang who has permit the researcher to do and finish this thesis.
2. Prof. DR. H. Suparman, M.Ag (1st Advisor) and DR. Muhyar Fanani, M.Ag (2nd Advisor) who taught and guided me in finishing this thesis.
3. All lecturers of Ushuluddin Faculty of State Institute for Islamic Studies (IAIN) Walisongo Semarang who have given knowledge so the researcher is able to finish this thesis.
4. All who directly or indirectly helps the researcher, both moral and material, in finishing this thesis.

Finally, the researcher is aware that this thesis is far from perfectness. But the researcher hopes that this thesis can be useful for the researcher and all readers.

Semarang, 21st November 2013

The Researcher

Muh Amiruddin

ENGLISH TRANSLITERATION SYSTEM¹

(International Version)

Consonants:

Arabic	Roman	Arabic	Roman	Arabic	Roman	Arabic	Roman
ب	b	ر	r	ع	'	و	w
ت	t	ز	z	غ	gh	ه	h
ث	th	س	s	ف	f	ء	'
ج	j	ش	sh	ق	q	ي	y
ح	ḥ	ص	ṣ	ك	k	ة	-a ¹
خ	kh	ض	ḍ	ل	l	ال	²
د	d	ط	ṭ	م	m	¹ in construct state: -at	
ذ	dh	ظ	ẓ	ن	n	² for article: al- and -l-	

Vowels:

Long		Doubled		Diphthongs		Short	
Arabic	Roman	Arabic	Roman	Arabic	Roman	Arabic	Roman
ا	ā	يَّ	iiy (final form i)	وَّ	au or aw	اَ	a
و	ū	وَّ	uww (final form u)	يَّ	ai or ay	اِ	i
ي	ī					اُ	u

¹ Quoted from *Pedoman Penulisan Skripsi*, Fakultas Ushuluddin IAIN Walisongo, Semarang, 2013, p. 140-141.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

COVER PAGE.....	i
ADVISOR APPROVAL.....	ii
RATIFICATION.....	iii
THESIS STATEMENT.....	iv
MOTTO.....	v
DEDICATION.....	vi
ABSTRACT.....	vii
PREFACE.....	ix
ENGLISH TRANSLITERATION SYSTEM.....	xi
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	xii
 CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION	
A. Research Background.....	1
B. Statement of Problem.....	7
C. Aim and Significant of Research.....	7
D. Prior Research.....	8
E. Research Methodology.....	10
1. Type of Research.....	10
2. Data Sources.....	10
3. Data Collection.....	12
4. Data Analysis.....	12
F. System of Writing.....	13
 CHAPTER II: ḤADĪTH AUTHENTICITY	
A. Meaning of Ḥadīth Authenticity.....	15
B. Urgency of Ḥadīth Authenticity.....	19
C. Thought Development of Ḥadīth Authenticity.....	21
1. Thought Development of Ḥadīth Authenticity in Classical Islamic Scholarship.....	21
2. Thought Development of Ḥadīth Authenticity in Western Scholarship.....	29

D. Criteria of Ḥadīth Authenticity.....	35
1. Criteria of Ḥadīth Authenticity in Muslim Scholarship.....	35
2. Criteria of Ḥadīth Authenticity in Western Scholarship.....	37

CHAPTER III: HARALD MOTZKI'S BIOGRAPHY AND METHOD

A. Biography of Harald Motzki.....	40
B. Works of Harald Motzki.....	42
C. Dating Ḥadīth Method.....	45
1. Dating on the Basis of the Matn.....	45
2. Dating on the Basis of the Occurrence of Ḥadīths in Collections.....	49
3. Dating on the Basis of the Sanad.....	50
4. Dating with Sanad and Matn.....	53
D. Basic Aim of Harald Motzki's Dating.....	54
E. <i>Isnād cum Matn</i> Analysis.....	57
1. Term of Chain Analysis.....	57
2. Concept of Chain Analysis.....	58
3. Method Steps of <i>Isnād cum Matn</i> Analysis.....	62
4. The Cases of his Method Application.....	66

CHAPTER IV: ANALYSIS

A. Position of Harald Motzki's View in Western Scholarship.....	74
B. Reliability of Harald Motzki's Method.....	81
C. Harald Motzki's View on Hadith Authenticity.....	89
1. Harald Motzki's Authentic Meaning.....	89
2. Harald Motzki's Authenticity Criteria.....	91
D. Harald Motzki's View about the Earlier Western Theory.....	93
1. Backward Projection.....	93
2. <i>Argumentum e Silentio</i>	94
3. Common Links.....	94

CHAPTER V: CLOSING

1. Conclusion.....	96
2. Suggestion.....	98
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	100
CURRICULUM VITAE.....	105