

## CHAPTER IV

### ANALYSIS OF SAYYID QUTB'S THOUGHT ON THE OBEDIENCE TO GOVERNMENT

#### A. The Pattern of Obedience to the Government on Sayyid Qutb's Perspective

Obedience to the state is no longer the providence of God, or indeed basically have to be so. But this is something human work, based on an agreement they made, although not unconditional obedience, but an obedience shown in return for certain guarantees. As an agreement, then the individual is always showing his obedience during the agreement is respected.<sup>1</sup>

Sayyid Qutb states that obedience to the leader is needed for the implementation of government. according to Qutb, obedience to the leader not because of their positions, but because of the implementation of Islamic law which they carried out in civic life. Thus, obedience to the leader is part of obedience to Allah and His Messenger, as described in surah An-Nisa' [4]: 59 God commanded to obey Allah, obey the Messengers, and the leader among Muslims.<sup>2</sup>

In this verse does not only contain the obligation of obedience to God, the Messenger and leader, but also became the basis the existence of political power and validity of government owned.<sup>3</sup> Validity of power leader has the meaning that the laws and political wisdom they decided, as long as it was not contrary to the Qur'an and Sunnah, have the forces that bind of all the people. Therefore all the people who are subject to the law obligated to keep it.<sup>4</sup>

According to Sayyid Qutb, a leader must be obeyed the leader of the Muslims themselves, who are qualified and Islamic restrictions as described in the Qur'an, which is the leader who obey God and the Messenger. Also a leader who recognizes that God is the only owner authority, and a source of law for humans, and returns to Him all matters disputed by the mind and understanding of those

---

<sup>1</sup> Dorothy Pickles, *Pengantar Ilmu Politik*, Rineka Cipta, Jakarta, 1991, p. 57

<sup>2</sup> Sayyid Qutb, *Keadilan Sosial dalam Islam*, terjemahan Afif Mohammad, (Bandung:Pustaka, 1984), p. 130-131 in Muhammad Iqbal dan Amin Husein Nasution, *Pemikiran Politik Islam: Dari Masa Klasik Hingga Indonesia Kontemporer*, Prenada Media Group, Jakarta, 2010, p. 214-215

<sup>3</sup> Abdul Mu'in Salim, *Fiqih Siyasah: Konsepsi Kekuasaan Politik dalam Al-Qur'an*, PT RajaGrafindo Persada, Jakarta, 1994, p. 241

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 242

who are not present in the texts (the Qur'an), to implement the general principles contained in the texts.

Obedience to the leader is within the bounds of good and in accordance with the laws of God, and as long as there are no texts that forbid it. Also not in the things that are forbidden by the *Shari'ah* principles when there is a difference of opinion. *As-Sunnah* has set the boundaries of obedience to the leader with a definite and convincing manner.<sup>5</sup>

Obedience to the leader is the development of obedience to God and His Messenger, because obeying a leader in Islam is not because of their office, but because they implement the law of God and His Messenger. So when he deviated from the lines that have been established by God and His Messengers, then there is no obligation to obey it; and all orders should not be implemented.<sup>6</sup>

Based on this matter can be understood that the obligation to obey the leader does not stand alone, but is related to obedience to the Prophet.<sup>7</sup> In this discussion it is clear that obedience and compliance was limited to the implementation of the Koran. As we know that, obedience to the leader is obligatory. And the form of absolute obedience, not accompanied by such limitations to a particular leader, or in certain affairs.<sup>8</sup> People really need to distinguish between, the government obey the good and the bad. We must not obey the command of bad leaders, but obeying a good leader is a must as a form of responsibility of the people.<sup>9</sup>

## **B. The Concept of Good Government and Good Governance on Sayyid Qutb's Perspective**

### 1) Good Government according to Sayyid Qutb

In the Qur'an and hadith did not find the term or concept of the state. This is understandable because the concept of the state or the nation-state emerged in the 16th century expressed by Nicolo Machiavelli (1469-1527). However, it does not mean that the concept of a state that does not exist at all in Islam, because there are

---

<sup>5</sup> Sayyid Qutb, *Tafsir fi Zhilalil-Qur'an di Bawah Naungan Al-Qur'an jilid 4*, terj. As'ad Yasin, dkk., Gema Insani Press, Jakarta, 2001, p. 310

<sup>6</sup> Sayyid Qutb, *op. cit.*, p. 131

<sup>7</sup> Abdul Mu'in Salim, *op. cit.*, p. 239

<sup>8</sup> Taqiyuddin An-Nabhani, *Sistem Pemerintahan Islam; Doktrin Sejarah dan Realitas Empirik*, terj. Moh. Magfur Wachid, Al Izzah, Jawa Timur, 1996, p. 336

<sup>9</sup> Kamarul Azmi Jasmi dan Yahaya Jusoh, *Pendidikan Politik dan Khilafah Islam dalam Pelbagai Perspektif*, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Malaysia, 2006, hlm. 77

some substantive Qur'anic verses and hadiths that show the existence of the rule of Muslims.

In the Qur'an and hadith are not explicitly mentioned whether the country is a republic or a monarchy, presidential or parliamentary system. Not explained too, how the system of appointment and dismissal of the head of state. As well, how the mechanisms of power that exist, whether there is a necessity to separate distribution (separation of power), the distribution (distribution of power) or authority pooling (integration of power) between the executive, and judiciary legeslatif.<sup>10</sup>

Good state not only comes from a good government, but also from citizenry. Islam teaches the things that bring good to the people of the Islamic government that they need to obey the government order to do good (doing good) even though it was not his own leader from among the pious or the person who takes the right people.<sup>11</sup>

Ideal state according to Islam is, countries that carry out the principles or values of civic life, namely: honesty and accountability (*al-amanah*), justice (*'adalah*), brotherhood (*al-ukhuwah*), value diversity or pluralism (*al-ta'addunniyah*), equation (*al-musawah*), deliberative (*al-syura*), put the peace (*al-silm*), control (*amr bi ma'ruf nahy 'an munkar*). Beside it, the ideal state is a state that makes Islamic law as the applicable law in the country. This can happen if religion still exist in the life of the state, not to make it as a thing to be separated from the state and is located only in the private sphere.<sup>12</sup>

Sayyid Qutb argues, "The ideal form of government is a state based on the rule of God's law. The system of government in the world should be based on human self servitude to God. Then, under the government system of religious individuals may choose to be followed. That way, every religion has belonged to God, in the sense that religion, obedience, submission, and worship all that only to God. "<sup>13</sup>

---

<sup>10</sup> Zainun Kamal, dkk., *Islam, Negara dan Civil Society Gerakan dan Pemikiran Islam Kontemporer*, Paramadina, Jakarta, 2005, p. 73-76

<sup>11</sup> Kamarul Azmi Jasmi dan Yahaya Jusoh, *op. cit.*, p. 81

<sup>12</sup> Zainun Kamal, dkk., *op. cit.*, p. 89

<sup>13</sup> Muhammad Iqbal dan Amin Husein Nasution, *Pemikiran Politik Islam: Dari Masa Klasik Hingga Indonesia Kontemporer*, Prenada Media Group, Jakarta, 2010, p. 213

According to Sayyid Qutb, an Islamic government is a government that carry out all forms of Islamic law. A society is not named as an Islamic society simply because it consists of people who call themselves Muslims but the Islamic law itself does not become law for these people, even if the obligations in Islam implemented. Islamic society is not a society that creates for itself "Islamic" homemade, apart from what has been established by God and the Prophet had described.<sup>14</sup>

Therefore, Sayyid Qutb rejected the sovereignty of the people. For him, man is only implementing sovereignty, and the law of God, and not allowed them execute the law, political, and so on contrary to the teachings and laws of God.

From this opinion, Sayyid Qutb argues that only Muslims are considered as the caliph God. Therefore, the right to vote and be elected as the head of state and members of the majlis shura held only by Muslims only.<sup>15</sup>

Sayyid Qutb uses the analogy at the time of Prophet Muhammad and intends to recreate the generation of the Qur'an. He wants to imitate the founders of the Islamic community, by creating an ideal society.<sup>16</sup> He wanted to use, the system of government at the time of the Prophet and applied at this time. Therefore, according to Sayyid Qutb ideal state is the state with an Islamic government. That state administration system, using the caliphate system.

However, because the conditions in many Muslim countries today do not or have not enabled the application of the principles and laws of Islam as a whole, for example because it is an extremely diverse country, then it can do is try to make the state system as much as possible or not opposed to the Islamic teachings.

But less likely to be able to make it happen, especially in Indonesia. As we know, in Indonesia there are many different religions and belief that it is impossible to rule the country based on the teachings of a particular religion. As said by Rousseau does not matter whether the country is a democracy or a

---

<sup>14</sup> Sayyid Qutb, *Pctunjuk Jalan*, terj. Abdul Hayyie al Kattani, Gema Insani Press, Jakarta, 2001, p. 116

<sup>15</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 214

<sup>16</sup> Ali Rahnama, (ed.), *Para Perintis Zaman Baru Islam*, terj. Ilyas Hasan, Mizan, Bandung, 1995, p. 161

monarchy form as long as it is in line with the needs and environment of the people it serves.<sup>17</sup>

## 2) Good Governance according to Sayyid Qutb

Obedient to the Muslim leader that apply Islamic law in government, even tyrannical and depriving the rights of the people, as long as not rule to disobedience and disbelief in God, the law is still obligatory for all Muslims. As explained in the Qur'an surah An-Nisa '[4]: 59.<sup>18</sup>

Leaders who have been choose directly and determined based on the agreement set out in the legislation be regarded to fulfill the requirements of leadership to carry out the mandate of the society. However, returning to their nature, humans have flaws and weaknesses. No man really have perfection. This indicates that at times people can be wrong and make mistakes. Even, it is possible, in certain circumstances humans trapped in disobedience and breaking the laws of God. If a leader has done iniquity and *munkar*, then it becomes obligatory to all elements of society and the nation to provide advice and warning to the leaders. If the leader does not also unmindful the advice and warnings and keep doing disobedience and *munkar*, then there is no obligation to obey his orders.<sup>19</sup>

*Fuqaha* are very concerned with the requirements that must be fulfilled by the chief of executive, to be able to create a clean government and authoritative. Some scholars require seven things: fair, knowledgeable to be able to *ijtihad* in new things, health the five senses, free from physical disabilities, competent (responsive), brave and a descendant of the *Quraish*. While other scholars argued only four terms or in terms of capabilities: knowledge, justice, skills, and sensory and physical health can have an impact on the smooth running of their duties. While not a mandatory requirement of Quraish descent.<sup>20</sup>

Based on the verses of the Qur'an which confirms that the supreme authority and sovereignty of God and only God has the right created the law, then Maududi raises the following principles: first, there is not a person, a group, or even the entire population of a country can to claim sovereignty. Only God who holds

---

<sup>17</sup> Henry J. Schmandt, *Filsafat Politik, Kajian Historis dari Zaman Yunani Kuno Sampai Zaman Modern*, terj. Baidlowi, imam Bahchaqi, pustaka pelajar, 2005, p. 406

<sup>18</sup> Taqiyuddin An-Nabhani, *Sistem Pemerintahan Islam; Doktrin Sejarah dan Realitas Empirik*, terj. Moh. Magfur Wachid, Al Izzah, Jawa Timur, 1996, p. 335

<sup>19</sup> Rachmat Ramadhana al-Banjari, *Prophetic Leadership*, DIVA Press, Jogjakarta, 2008, p. 281-282

<sup>20</sup> Zainun Kamal, dkk., *op. cit.*, p. 340

sovereignty in the true sense. All humans are just implementing the sovereignty of God.

Second, God is the creator of the real law, so that only He has the right to make legislation unanimously. Humans allowed to make legislation along it does not conflict with the basic legislation that comes from the Quran. Thus we can not make modifications to the law, which has been set by God. Third, a government that runs the basic rules of God as explained by the Prophet shall require obedience of the people, for the government as it is, in principle, act as a political entity that enforces the regulations of God.<sup>21</sup>

According to Sayyid Qutb, a leader must be obeyed is the leader of the Muslims themselves, who are qualified and Islamic limitations as described in the Qur'an, which is the leader who obey God and the Messenger. Also leader Oneness of God, as the only owner and source of the law authority for humans as defined in the texts, and returns to Him all matters disputed by the mind and the understanding that there are no texts to him, to apply the general principles that contained in the texts.

Obey the leader is within the bounds of good and in accordance with the law God, and as long as there are no texts that forbid it. Also not in the things that are forbidden according to the Shari'ah principles when there is a difference of opinion. As-Sunnah has set the boundaries of obedience to the leader with a definite and convincing manner.<sup>22</sup>

According to Sayyid Qutb, the appropriate leader regulate human life, is the leader of which has it's own set of human existence on earth. They should not be obedient to the *manhaj*, authority, and management, beside of that regulate this universe, even their own existence against their will.<sup>23</sup>

The role of a leader is not to make law, or new ways of governing; otherwise it is limited to the supervision of the implementation of shari'ah. when like this, then he obeyed. Obedience of the people, depends on the obedience of the who ruled on the shari'ah. If he deviated ended their obligation to obey. The Qur'an

---

<sup>21</sup> Abul A'la Al-Mududi, *Khilafah dan kerajaan; Evaluasi Kritis Atas Sejarah Pemerintahan Islam*, terj. Muhammad Al-Baqir, Mizan, Bandung, 1996, p. 21-22

<sup>22</sup> Sayyid Qutb, *Tafsir fi Zhilalil-Qur'an di Bawah Naungan Al-Qur'an jilid 4*, terj. As'ad Yasin, dkk., Gema Insani Press, Jakarta, 2001, p. 310

<sup>23</sup> Sayyid Quthb, *Petunjuk Jalan*, terj. Abdul Hayyic al-Kattani dan Yodi Indrayadi, Gema Insani Press, Jakarta, 2001, p. 51

clearly states that anyone who is not ruled by God's revelation (the Qur'an) is a infidel, not to be obeyed, and must be resisted by the Muslims.<sup>24</sup>

People have the right and obligation to supervise the government and expressed criticism of his political actions when the state is not supposed to stand on principle. There are many verses and hadith which asserts that warned against the error occurred, an important task for a Muslim, especially if the error was made by the government.<sup>25</sup>

### C. **Some Critical Views: Prospect of Qutub's Thought in The Whole Word**

Based on the explanation above, the researchers disagree with what was said by Sayyid Qutb about leaders who must be obeyed is the leader of the Muslims. Leaders must still be obeyed although are not Muslims, as long as what he did accordance with existing rules and for the mutual benefit without harming any party. Although we dislike the leader existing, it does not mean we do not obey them. Because obey the leader is obligatory for all citizens. Obedience to authority is required in order to implement the government, so that all state systems running well and smoothly.

As we know, in a country made up of many different religions and beliefs. If we decide everything just based on one particular religion it will lead to conflict. As stated by Hobbes, "Religion became one of the triggers of warfare among humans. Inconsistent with the concept of trust is often a source of conflict that led to the war. Religious believers fanatic, make the militants to maintain its ideology.<sup>26</sup>

According to Hobbes Obey existing administration is a consequence or result of the social contract. due to the absence of such agreement, all state power is concentrated in the hands of the king, it means the king as absolute ruler.<sup>27</sup>

No wonder if the thought of Sayyid Qutb about the criteria of leader that must be obeyed is the leader of the Muslims themselves, the strong protests of the thinkers of his time or afterwards. Because it means the leader who comes apart from Islam does not have to be obeyed.

---

<sup>24</sup> John L. Esposito, (ed.), *Dinamika Kebangunan Islam; Watak, Proses, dan tantangan*, terj. Bakri Siregar, Rajawali, Jakarta, 1987, p. 105

<sup>25</sup> Muhammad Asad, *Sebuah Kajian Tentang Sistem Pemerintahan Islam*, terj. Afif Mohammad, Pustaka, Bandung, 1985, p. 135-136

<sup>26</sup> [http://: Pemikiran Thomas Hobes, Amalia Wardahni.htm](http://PemikiranThomasHobes,AmaliaWardahni.htm), diakses pada 19-9-2014 jam 10.15

<sup>27</sup> O. Notohamidjojo, *Makna Negara Hukum*, Badan Penerbit Kristen, Jakarta, 1970, hal. 13.

Good leaders are not only those who are obedient and obey the command of God, but a good leader is that they can carry out the mandate given to them and the people who prefer the public interest than private interests.

According to the authors, there are no specific requirements that must be fulfilled by a country in order to be a good government administration. Provided that the general principles of a country are fulfilled; such as peace and deliberation, then the government could be called good governance.

As said by Rousseau does not matter whether the country in the form of democracy or monarchy as long as he is in line with the needs and environment of the people it serves.<sup>28</sup> In other words, state or good government is capable of serving the needs of the community and meet the general principles of a country.

According to the authors, Sayyid Qutb's thought too idealist so it can not be applied in all countries, including Indonesia. As we know, that in every country consists of many different religions and it is impossible to use a particular religion to organize a state. As we know, that the thought of Sayyid Qutb much influenced by 'Abbas Mahmud al-'Aqqad, an Egyptian writer who tends to western thought.<sup>29</sup> In addition, thought Sayyid Qutb also influenced by the writings of Muhammad Assad (Leopold Weiss) and Abu al-A'la Mawdudi.<sup>30</sup> As we know they are productive and critical scientist of his time. No wonder the Qutb very critical thinking and tend to western thought.

It is understandable that at the time of Sayyid Qutb in Egypt was going on war and discord among Muslims themselves. According to the authors, Sayyid Qutb's attitude is simply a manifestation of disappointment on existing governments. Spent several years in America Sayyid Qutb made aware of how Muslims are very easily provoked by outsiders (non-Muslims). Therefore, he was disappointed with the government and want to bring back the reign of Muhammad to the present. As a manifestation of his displeasure on the existing government, Qutb joined the Muslim Brotherhood against the government that work together with the west.

---

<sup>28</sup> Henry J. Schmandt, *Filsafat Politik, Kajian Historis dari Zaman Yunani Kuno Sampai Zaman Modern*, terj. Baidlowi, imam Bahchaqi, pustaka pelajar, 2005, p. 406

<sup>29</sup> Muhammad Iqbal dan Amin Husein Nasution, *Pemikiran Politik Islam: Dari Masa Klasik Hingga Indonesia Kontemporer*, Prenada Media Group, Jakarta, 2010, hlm. 209

<sup>30</sup> John L. Esposito, (ed.), *op. cit.*, hlm. 71



However, because of the condition of each country is different and there are many different religions and beliefs that are not allow to rule the country by a certain religious teachings. Even in a predominantly Muslim country was not possible to apply the principles and laws of Islam as a whole.